

FOUR C'S SKILLS INTEGRATION IN THE LESSON PLANS OF GRADE 7 ENGLISH TEACHER

^{#1}Ellis Tamela, ^{*2}Maura Hanifah Dwi

^{#1}English Lecturer, Faculty of Languages and Art, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia

^{*2}English Student, Faculty of Languages and Art, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia

Corresponding Author Email: ellistamela@unj.ac.id

ABSTRACTS

Four C skills' integration in English curriculum has been investigated in recent years. Unfortunately, those studies focused on the integration of 4Cs in lesson plans carried out in elementary schools. Thus, this research aimed to analyze how the 4C skills were implemented in English lesson plans of 7th grade. The data were collected through content analysis on ten lesson plans of public and private junior high schools in Jakarta and Bekasi. It was found that all analyzed lesson plans have incorporated the 4Cs skills; communication, collaboration, critical thinking, and creativity. However, there were indicators of each skill that more dominantly appeared in a certain topic or were seen not to be incorporated in any examined lesson plans. In addition, teachers mostly incorporated the 4Cs skills in the learning activity and assessment. Although all the analyzed lesson plans have integrated 4Cs, the fulfilment of the indicators of each skill still needed to be improved. These findings are expected to be a recommendation for educators especially English teachers in designing lesson plans which integrated the 4C skills as the keys to a lifetime of learning and creative work as the current world of work is required leads to the need for integration of 4Cs in the classroom.

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received: October, 2021

Revised: November, 2021

Published: December, 2021

Keywords:

4C Skills,
Lesson Plans,
English Grade 7

How to cite: Tamela, E., & Dwi, M. (2021). Four C's Skills Integration in the Lesson Plans of Grade 7 English Teacher. *Jo-ELT (Journal of English Language Teaching) Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa & Seni Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris IKIP*, 8(2), 124-138. doi:<https://doi.org/10.33394/jo-elt.v8i2.4345>

INTRODUCTION

In the need of integrating 4Cs into the four language skills, Yu & Mohammad (2019) conducted research in order to improve English writing skills of 3K class students. The study's data were gathered using pre-and post-tests, observation, and semi-structured interviews. The participants of this study were 16 female students and 16 male students. The results show that the ability to write simple English sentences among 3K class students improved after participating in two sets of interventions that included components of collaboration, communication, creativity, and critical thinking according to the result of the mean score of pre-test in 19.34 and the mean score of post-test in 22.6. The findings of the observation indicated that students were excited and showed a lot of interest when they were informed that interventions would be conducted in groups of four. During the interventions, it was found that the students in the group with better writing skills asked questions that helped the weaker members of the group to think critically and creatively in order to list the keywords based on the given topic. The results of semi-structured interviews also revealed that weaker students felt that the guidance of more competent peers helped them generate

writing ideas and improve their knowledge of capitalization, spelling, grammar, and punctuation.

The integration of 4C skills during the teaching-learning process has been examined in recent years. However, the focus was mainly on one skill, critical thinking (Snyder & Snyder, 2008; Terasne & Sugianto, 2019; Wahab & Terasne, 2020; Zhao, Pandian, & Mehar Singh, 2016), even though all 4C skills should be included (NEA, n.d.). Critical thinking has been highlighted due to its characterization originated from Bloom's Taxonomy which was globally known (Fadel, Charles, Bialik, Maya, and Trilling, 2015). Indonesian curriculum has also considered this skill essential by publishing the guide to teach critical thinking at school (Ariyana, Pudjiastuti, Bestary, & Zamromi, 2018).

The 21st century skills framework according to P21 has also been implemented and adapted to the demands of education in Indonesia based on the results of the study of documents on the National Education System Law, Nawacita, RPJMN for Basic, Middle, and Higher Education, obtained two additional standards in accordance with Curriculum and Government policies, which are Character Development and Spiritual Values. Overall, P21 in Indonesia is formulated as the Indonesian Partnership for the 21st Century Skill Standard (IP-21CSS) (Ariyana et al., 2018). As a result, a number of studies regarding this issue have been developed, especially the insertion of 4C in English lesson plans of teachers, from primary to secondary schools.

In primary school, the studies were conducted to investigate the challenges faced by EFL teachers and their readiness in developing students' 4Cs skills which result found that both teachers of public and private schools have similar obstacles in developing student 4Cs skills. The problems included the difficulties in understanding specific effective methods of learning that assist the development of 4Cs skills, obstacles in developing a lesson plan for 4Cs skills, inadequate infrastructure, and students who lack confidence, effectiveness, and the ability to express their opinion. Moreover, English teachers both in the city and suburb area mostly inserted learning and innovation skills (4Cs) compared to other 21st century skills in the English's lesson plans (Luciana, Ni Luh Ratih, Padmadewi, NN, Artini, LP, 2020; Septiyanti, Siti Nur Azizah, and Fajriah, 2021).

The studies to develop a lesson plan integrating 4C has been done by Wulandari, Juarsa, & Agusdianita (2020) in English lesson and Dwimayanti, K, Dantes, N, and Suarni (2020) with the theme of *Kegiatanku*, using a research and development method. The validation was carried out by PGSD lecturers and elementary school teachers, also lectures, supervisors, and school principals. In the first step of the development procedure, researchers found that teachers have been used thematic learning lesson plans. However, only a few were innovatively designed lesson plan according to the integration of 21st century skills. The lesson plans used by teachers were often only copies from the previous lesson plans or from other teachers in order to fulfil administrative obligations without paying attention to the integration of 21st century skills in the lesson plans. Hence, an innovative lesson plans which incorporate the 4C skills was developed.

An analysis of the integration of 4C in English lesson plans of senior high school teachers indicated that all of the four 4C skills, which consist of creativity and innovation, critical thinking and problem solving, communication, and collaboration were found to be incorporated in all lesson plans were analyzed. Some of the 4C skills were discovered to be used in all lesson plans, regardless of their topics, while others were observed to be more dominantly integrated into lesson plans that discussed specific topic categories. The finding of this study also revealed that the 4C skills are mostly included in the same four types of lesson plan components, which are learning steps, assessment, learning methods, and indicator of competence achievement (IPK). However, the collaboration did not include in the indicator of competence achievement (IPK). This study was expected to lead teachers to

select the 4C skills to be integrated into the lesson plans and the components (Radifan & Dewanti, 2020).

Another lesson besides English whose lesson plan was analysed was *Fikih*-subject to reveal the content of PPK, Literacy, 4C, and HOTS elements in the syllabus and lesson plans of 10th grade for the odd semester at MAN 2 Pasuruan, East Java. This study was carried out by using a qualitative descriptive. The results show that the 4Cs elements contained in the lesson plans are only limited to communication and collaboration, while critical thinking, creativity, and problem-solving have not been included. This result indicated that the integration of 4Cs in the lesson plans still needed to be improved (Fatimah, Tajuddin, Ilyas, & Majid, 2020).

Based on the previous studies, the integration of 4Cs in the lesson plans has not fully contained the four elements which are communication, collaboration, creativity, and critical thinking. In addition, the research on the integration of 4Cs in lesson plans is more often carried out in elementary schools. Thus, this research is conducted in order to provide a better understanding and overview of how the 4Cs skills are implemented in English lesson plans of 7th grade, as well as how each skill is integrated and analyze the extent to which the 4C skills are incorporated in the lesson plans of 7th grade English teachers' lesson plans. The result of this study is expected to provide an understanding and an overview of the implementation of 4Cs skills in the lesson plans of 7th grade English teachers and how each of the skills is integrated.

RESEARCH METHOD

Qualitative approach with content analysis method will be adapted in this study since the samples are 7th grade English teachers' lesson plans which used Indonesian language. According to Smulowitz (2017), content analysis is a method in which researcher analyses or evaluates the significance of documents gathered as data throughout the research process. The procedures in collecting the data are: a) apply the consent form to study program for collecting data from schools, b) contact a number of schools to gain access to the lesson plans, c) collect the lesson plans which are accessible, d) sort the lesson plans into the first and second semester (there are 10 lesson plans in total) and e) name the lesson plans with codes, LP 1, LP 2, LP 3, etc.

Research Design

This study used content analysis, which is defined by Krippendorff (2004) is a research technique for developing replicable and reliable inference from text (or other relevant matter) to the context in which it is used. This process takes place over a period of time, beginning the collecting the documents and ending with the interpretation of the data obtained through analysis. This study will be implemented non-random sampling by using convenience sampling in gathering data.

Subject

There are ten lesson plans as the data source. The lesson plans are classified into lesson plans of the first semester and the second semester in which each semester has 5 lesson plans to be analyzed. The lesson plans are derived from a public junior high school located in Jakarta and Bekasi.

Instruments

The instruments for this study are tables of indicators for each skill. The indicators were taken from various sources.

- a. Communication (Fadel, Charles, Bialik, Maya, and Trilling, 2015; Metusalem, R., Belenky, D. M., & DiCerbo, 2017)
- b. Collaboration (Hall, 2013; Lai, Emily. DiCerbo, Kristen, and Foltz, 2017)
- c. Critical thinking (Ariyana et al., 2018; Fadel, Charles, Bialik, Maya, and Trilling, 2015; Kivunja, 2014; Ventura, Lai, & DiCerbo, 2017; Zhao et al., 2016)
- d. Creativity (Fadel, Charles, Bialik, Maya, and Trilling, 2015; Kivunja, 2014; Lai, Yarbro, DiCerbo, & Geest, 2018)

Data Analysis

The data were analysed using a checklist of the integration of 4Cs skills which examined at how each 4Cs skills was fulfilled in a number of indicators. These indicators were generated from a variety of 21st century skills-related sources. The analysis' results were then used to see the integration of 4Cs skills in the lesson plans which answered the first study question and also to find how the 4Cs skill is implemented in the lesson plans which answered the second study question.

Meanwhile, in a qualitative study, the author(s) should mention the model to be used in analyzing the data. This brief explanation is further followed by the application of each stage within the selected model.

RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Research Findings

First to be discussed is the communication skill as represented in table 1.

Table 1
The Integration of Communication Skill in the Lesson Plans

No.	Indicators	Integration in Lesson Plans									
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1	Involve collaborative tasks (using speaking, writing, listening, and reading).	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
2	Incorporate peer feedback.	✓						✓	✓	✓	✓
3	Utilize role play in teaching interpersonal communication.	✓	✓								
4	Have students reflect on their project.					✓				✓	
5	Explicitly teach and assess communication skills for modern digital channels.	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
6	Teach students to recognize and count for cultural differences in communicative norms										
7	Incorporate the assessment of communication skills (production, reception, intercultural).	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

Table 1 indicates the indicators that are used to determine the integration of communication skills in each lesson plan. It shows that two indicators of communication skill are integrated into all lesson plans despite the topic discussed in them, they are, a) involve collaborative tasks (using speaking, writing, listening, reading) and b) incorporate the

assessment of communication skills (production, reception, intercultural). These passages are to confirm the findings: *Diberikan tabel yang berkaitan dengan ungkapan terima kasih dan permintaan maaf, peserta didik diminta melengkapinya secara berkelompok* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Berkelompok berlatih membuat kalimat tentang jumlah dan letak suatu benda disekitar sekolah* (Lesson Plan 4, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Menulis paragraf sederhana dari hasil wawancara temannya dan membacakan hasil wawancara* (Lesson Plan 3, in *Penilaian Pembelajaran*). *Siswa yang belum mencapai KKM diberi kegiatan untuk mendengarkan dan menirukan teks deskriptif lisan dan tulis dengan memberi dan meminta informasi terkait dengan deskripsi orang, binatang dan benda, fungsi sosial* (Lesson Plan 6, in *Penilaian Pembelajaran Remedial*).

It also indicates that lesson plans that incorporate utilize role play in teaching interpersonal communication is only integrated in the lesson plans which discuss about greeting, leave taking and introducing self, as it follows : *secara berpasangan, peserta didik menulis dialog pendek berdasarkan situasi yang diberikan tentang menyapa dan berpamitan, kemudian melakukan role play menggunakan dialog yang telah mereka buat* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik melakukan roleplay secara berpasangan tentang perkenalan diri seperti contoh diatas* (Lesson Plan 2, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

Meanwhile, lesson plans that discuss about descriptive text and song are more exhibit to have student reflect on their project, as example: *Peserta didik diminta melakukan pemeriksaan tulisan dalam paragraf kembali dalam hal grammar, ejaan, tanda baca dan lain-lain* (Lesson Plan 5, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik diberikan kesempatan untuk menilai kemampuan dirinya sendiri* (Lesson Plan 9, in *Penilaian Pembelajaran*).

From the ten lesson plans that have been examined, there is one indicator that appears to be included in the five lesson plans, but the rest of it does not include the indicator. That is the second indicator, “incorporate peer feedback”. Lesson plans which not include the second indicator are discussed about introducing self, date and time, and descriptive text. These following passages show the incorporates of peer-feedback in the lesson plans: *Peserta didik saling bertukar surat dengan peserta didik lain dalam kelompok dan saling memberikan komentar atau masukan* (Lesson Plan 8, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik mempresentasikan hasil kerja kelompok atau individu secara klasikal menggunakan pendapat atau presentasi yang dilakukan dan kemudian ditanggapi kembali oleh kelompok atau inividu yang mempresentasikan* (Lesson Plan 10, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

Moreover, there is one indicator that seemed to be included in each analysed lesson plans except one lesson plan which has topic about texts of instruction, short notice and warning or caution, that is fifth indicator, “explicitly teach and assess communication for modern digital channel”. The indicator is implemented in the lesson plans as it follows: *Mengamati video tentang sapaan dan pamitan* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Melihat video tentang binatang yang sering ada disekitar dan yang sering dijumpai di kebun binatang* (Lesson Plan 4, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Mengamati dengan seksama materi fungsi sosial yang sedang dipelajari dalam bentuk gambar/video/slide presentasi yang disajikan dan mencoba untuk menginterpretasikannya* (Lesson Plan 9, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

Aside from those, there is also an indicator that does not seem to be incorporated in any of the lesson plans that have been analyzed. That is the sixth indicator, “teach students to recognize and count for cultural differences in communicative norms”.

From all the explanations above, it can be concluded that indicators of communication skills are not fully integrated into all lesson plans. It is also indicated that components of lesson plans which more dominantly contain communication skills are in the learning activities and learning assessments.

The second skill that is Collaboration skill can be observed in table 2.

Table 2
The Integration of Collaboration Skill in the Lesson Plans

No.	Indicators	Integration in Lesson Plans									
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1	Establish learning objectives for collaboration.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	
2	Plan for and use group activities as opportunities to reinforce and practice collaboration skills	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
3	Encourage students in a group to be responsible for their task	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
4	Allow students to choose which of the defined roles in a task they would like to play, but encourage them to practice playing different roles over time.	✓	✓	✓			✓				
5	Rotate groups so that students gain experience working with a different types of individuals and teams										
6	Stimulate interaction during the collaborative activity	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
7	Engage students in the process of solving complex problems and authentic task activity.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
8	Provide and encourage feedback from teachers and peers.	✓				✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

Table 2 indicates the indicators that are used to determine the integration of collaboration in each lesson plan. It points out that four indicators of collaboration skill are integrated into all lesson plans regardless of the topic discussed in them. They are, a) plan for and use group activities as opportunities to reinforce and practice collaboration skills, b) encourage students in a group to be responsible for their task, c) stimulate interaction during the collaborative activity, and d) engage students in the process of solving complex problems and authentic task activity. These passages are to justify the results: *Secara berpasangan peserta didik menulis dialog pendek berdasarkan situasi yang diberikan tentang menyapa dan berpamitan kemudian melakukan roleplay menggunakan dialog yang telah mereka buat* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Berkelompok berlatih membuat kalimat tentang jumlah dan letak suatu benda disekitar sekolah* (Lesson Plan 4, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik membaca pertanyaan di Exercise 1 dan bersama temannya mendiskusikan jawabannya* (Lesson Plan 5, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik mewawancari temannya kemudian menuliskannya di format yang diberikan* (Lesson Plan 2, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

Meanwhile, the first indicator of the collaboration skill which contains of establish learning objectives for collaboration seems to be incorporated in every analysed lesson plan except the one which discuss about the text of instruction, short notice, and caution. These following passages show the incorporation of learning objectives for collaboration in the lesson plans: *Menghargai dan menghayati perilaku jujur, disiplin, tanggung jawab, peduli (toleransi dan gotong royong) santun, percaya diri dalam berinteraksi secara efektif dengan*

lingkungan sosial dan alam dalam jangkauan pergaulan dan keberadaannya (Lesson Plan 6, in *Kompetensi Inti*). Mengidentifikasi fungsi sosial, struktur teks dan unsur kebahasaan teks interaksi transaksional lisan dan tulis yang melibatkan tindakan memberi dan meminta informasi terkait dengan tingkah laku atau tindakan atau fungsi orang, binatang, benda sesuai dengan konteks penggunaannya (Lesson Plan 7, in *Kompetensi Dasar*). Menunjukkan kemampuan keterampilan menalar, mengolah dan menyaji secara kreatif, produktif, kritis, mandiri, kolaboratif dan komunikatif dalam ranah konkret dan ranah abstrak sesuai dengan apa yang dipelajari di sekolah dan sumber lain yang sama dalam sudut pandang teori (Lesson Plan 9, in *Kompetensi Inti*).

Similar to the first indicator, the eight indicator of collaboration skill indicates to be applied in every examined lesson plan except three lesson plans that have topics on the greeting and leave taking, introducing self, and describing people, animal, thing and place. These following passages are to justify the integration of feedback from teachers and peers: *Peserta didik saling berdiskusi dan memberikan masukan* (Lesson Plan 5, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Guru memberikan rangkuman masukan dari peserta didik dan catatan selama monitoring* (Lesson Plan 7, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik mempresentasikan hasil kerja kelompok atau individu secara klasikal, mengemukakan pendapat atas presentasi yang dilakukan kemudian ditanggapi oleh kelompok atau individu yang mempresentasikan* (Lesson Plan 10, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

It also indicates that only four lesson plans afford an opportunity for students to choose which of the defined roles in a task they would like to play and the teacher's encouragement for them to practice playing different roles over time. The four lesson plans have topics on greeting and leave-taking, introducing self, date and time, and descriptive text as follows: *Please play a role based on the dialogue you have written* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Instrumen Penilaian, Kisi-kisi, dan Soal*). *Peserta didik melakukan roleplay secara berpasangan tentang perkenalan diri seperti contoh di atas* (Lesson Plan 2, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Membuat dialog sederhana secara berpasangan dengan role cards* (Lesson Plan 3, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Work in pairs and perform the dialogue. This picture (an idol) helps you make your dialogue (role play)* (Lesson Plan 6, in *Instrumen Penilaian, Kisi-kisi, dan Soal*).

In addition, there is one indicator that does not seem to be incorporated in any of the lesson plans that have been analyzed. That is the fifth indicator, "rotate group so that students gain experience working with different types of individuals and teams".

Considering all of the findings, it can be concluded that the indicators of collaboration skills have not been fully integrated into all lesson plans. Moreover, the indicators are more dominantly incorporated in the learning activities than other components of lesson plans.

As the third skill to be analysed that is critical thinking, it can be seen in table 3.

Table 3
The Integration of Critical Thinking Skill in the Lesson Plans

No.	Indicators	Integration in Lesson Plans									
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1	Incorporate teacher's questioning of lower-level and higher-level questions					✓		✓	✓		
2	Includes instruction in metacognitive methods		✓	✓	✓					✓	✓
3	Includes direct instruction of critical thinking skills							✓	✓	✓	✓

4	Incorporates strategy for group discussion									✓
5	Incorporates strategy for debate									
6	Incorporates strategy for reciprocal peer questioning									✓
7	Implements problem-based learning as a learning model									✓
8	Includes activities involving collaborative learning	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
9	Included concept mapping task									✓
10	Includes assessment indicators based on the cognitive processes of Higher Order Thinking Skills	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓

For the next skill, table 3 presents the indicators that are used to analyze the integration of critical thinking skills in the lesson plans. It can be seen that there is only one indicator that seems to be incorporated in all lesson plans regardless of the topic discussed in them. That is the eight indicator which contains of involving activities of collaborative learning. These following passages are to support the results: *Diberikan tabel yang berkaitan dengan kegiatan menyapa dan berpamitan dan peserta didik diminta untuk melengkapinya secara berkelompok (Lesson Plan 1, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Membuat dialog sederhana secara berpasangan dengan role cards (Lesson Plan 3, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Berkelompok berlatih membuat kalimat tentang jumlah binatang yang ada disekitarnya atau sering dijumpai di kebun binatang (Lesson Plan 4, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Peserta didik dalam kelompok mereka mulai menuangkan hal-hal yang telah mereka diskusikan dalam bentuk 'draft' tulisan (Lesson Plan 5, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).*

Besides, the is one indicator of critical thinking skill which incorporated in each examined lesson plan except three lesson plans that discuss about introducing self, habitual action and texts of instruction, short notice, and warning or caution. That is the =tenth indicator which reads, "Includes assessment indicators based on Higher Order Thinking Skills". These passages are the substantiation to support the discoveries: *Write a simple description text to promote your school, a tourist object, or your hometown (Lesson Plan 4, in Instrumen Penilaian, Kisi-kisi, dan Soal). Unjuk kerja (tanya jawab, berdiskusi kelompok, dan membuat sebuah personal email) (Lesson Plan 5, in Instrumen Penilaian Keterampilan). Work in pairs and perform a dialogue. This picture (an idol) helps you make your dialogue (Lesson Plan 6, in Instrumen Penilaian, Kisi-kisi, dan Soal). Kompetensi Dasar: Menulis Karangan Deskriptif (Lesson Plan 9, in Penilaian Keterampilan).*

Meanwhile, there are four indicators that is only incorporated in one lesson plan : a) Incorporates strategy for group discussion, b) Incorporates strategy for reciprocal peer questioning, c) Implements Problem-based Learning as a learning model, and d) Includes concept mapping task, as can be seen in the following passages: *Peserta didik dalam kelompok kecil melakukan diskusi dengan topik pembahasan pada Exercise 8 hal.99 (Lesson Plan 7, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Guru memberikan kesempatan kepada peserta didik untuk mengidentifikasi sebanyak mungkin pertanyaan yang berkaitan dengan gambar yang disajikan dan akan dijawab melalui kegiatan belajar, contohnya: Mengajukan pertanyaan tentang materi: Ucapan, tekanan kata, intonasi, ejaan, tanda baca dan tulisan tangan yang tidak dipahami dari apa yang diamati atau pertanyaan untuk mendapatkan informasi*

tambahan tentang apa yang diamati (dimulai dari pertanyaan faktual sampai ke pertanyaan yang bersifat hipotetik) untuk mengembangkan kreativitas, rasa ingin tahu, kemampuan merumuskan pertanyaan untuk membentuk pikiran kritis yang perlu untuk hidup cerdas dan belajar sepanjang hayat (Lesson Plan 9, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Model pembelajaran: Discovery Learning, Problem-Based Learning (Lesson Plan 9, in Model Pembelajaran). Memberikan tugas membuat teks deskriptif berdasarkan gambar dan mind map yang telah dibuatnya (Lesson Plan 4, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).

Moreover, there are some indicators which more dominantly incorporated in certain topics. Begin with the first indicator of critical thinking skill which reads, "Incorporates teacher's questioning of lower-level and higher-level questions" that is only incorporated in lesson plans which have topics on things around us, habitual action, and descriptive text. To support the findings, it can be seen in the following passages: *Guru menampilkan gambar dari SB halaman 61 dan menanyakan 'Who's in the picture? How are they feeling?' (Lesson Plan 5, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Guru menampilkan gambar dari SB halaman 99 dan menanyakan: "Look at the photo! What do you think is strange about the school?" (Lesson Plan 7, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Guru menanyakan: Have you ever sent any postcards to your friends or relatives? When? What is it about? (Lesson Plan 8, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).*

Similar with the eight-indicator, the third indicator of critical thinking skill which reads, "Includes direct instruction of critical thinking skills" is more dominantly integrated in lesson plans which discussed topic of habitual action, descriptive text, song and texts of instruction, short notice, warning or caution. These passages indicate the integration of the third indicator in lesson plans: *Peserta didik membuka SB dan menyimak dialog video dan meminta peserta didik mengidentifikasi contoh kalimat 'first conditional' (Lesson Plan 7, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Peserta didik menunjuk postcard masing-masing dan menganalisa bagian-bagian dalam sebuah postcard (Lesson Plan 8, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Guru memberikan kesempatan kepada peserta didik untuk mengidentifikasi sebanyak mungkin pertanyaan yang berkaitan dengan gambar yang disajikan dan akan dijawab melalui kegiatan belajar, contohnya: Mengajukan pertanyaan tentang materi : Ucapan, tekanan kata, intonasi, ejaan, tanda baca dan tulisan tangan yang tidak dipahami dari apa yang diamati atau pertanyaan untuk mendapatkan informasi tambahan tentang apa yang diamati (dimulai dari pertanyaan faktual sampai ke pertanyaan yang bersifat hipotetik) untuk mengembangkan kreativitas, rasa ingin tahu, kemampuan merumuskan pertanyaan untuk membentuk pikiran kritis yang perlu untuk hidup cerdas dan belajar sepanjang hayat (Lesson Plan 9, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Guru memberikan kesempatan pada peserta didik untuk mengidentifikasi sebanyak mungkin pertanyaan yang berkaitan dengan gambar yang disajikan dan akan dijawab melalui kegiatan belajar khususnya pada materi Teks (a) instruksi (instruction), (b) tanda atau rambu (short notice), (c) tanda peringatan (warning/caution), lisan dan tulis (Lesson Plan 10, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran).*

In addition, the second indicator of critical thinking skill which contains of instruction in metacognitive methods seems to be incorporated in half of analysed lesson plans while the rest of it are not integrated instruction in metacognitive methods. These provided passages are the example of instruction in metacognitive methods in the lesson plans: *Dengan bimbingan guru, peserta didik merumuskan pertanyaan terkait dengan isi, fungsi sosial dan struktur teks serta unsur kebahasaan dalam video yang telah disaksikan (Lesson Plan 2, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Merumuskan pertanyaan terkait dengan isi, fungsi sosial dan struktur teks serta unsur kebahasaan dalam video yang telah disaksikan (Lesson Plan 4, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Guru memberikan kesempatan kepada peserta didik untuk mengidentifikasi sebanyak mungkin pertanyaan yang berkaitan dengan gambar yang disajikan dan akan dijawab melalui kegiatan belajar, contohnya: Mengajukan pertanyaan tentang materi:*

Ucapan, tekanan kata, intonasi, ejaan, tanda baca dan tulisan tangan yang tidak dipahami dari apa yang diamati atau pertanyaan untuk mendapatkan informasi tambahan tentang apa yang diamati (dimulai dari pertanyaan faktual sampai ke pertanyaan yang bersifat hipotetik) untuk mengembangkan kreativitas, rasa ingin tahu, kemampuan merumuskan pertanyaan untuk membentuk pikiran kritis yang perlu untuk hidup cerdas dan belajar sepanjang hayat (Lesson Plan 9, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). Aside from those, there is one indicator that not integrated in any lesson plans. that is the fifth indicator which reads, “Incorporates strategy for debate”.

As all things considered, the researchers can conclude that indicators of critical thinking are not fully incorporated in all analyzed lesson plans. There are some indicators which more-dominantly applied in certain topics and also there is an indicator that not incorporated in any lesson plans. In the lesson plans, the teacher is more likely to check students’ understanding than to give students’ practice other critical thinking skills such as analyzing and evaluating. Teachers tend to jump into process cognitive of creating. Therefore, to design lesson plans in which incorporated all the indicators of critical thinking skills, teachers should be more pay attention to the process of Higher Order Thinking Skills.

The last skill of 4C is creativity, as it is presented in table 4.

Table 4
The Integration of Creativity Skill in the Lesson Plans

No.	Indicators	Integration in Lesson Plans									
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1	Incorporate activities conducted out of school or their classroom to increase activity	✓		✓	✓						✓
2	Build good and respectful relationships between teachers and learners	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
3	Involve activities conducted open-ended, problem-based learning	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
4	Incorporate activities in which students can work collaboratively	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
5	Incorporate role play and or other improvisation activities	✓	✓				✓				
6	Manages a learning environment that encourage students to solve an authentic real-world problem and to be inquisitive with an open mind	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
7	Incorporate the assessment of creativity through divergent thinking, self-report, and or assessment of creative works	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
8	Use a defined creativity rubric with separate dimensions to novelty and usefulness	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓		

It can be seen from table 4 that the indicators are used to define the integration of creativity in each lesson plan. It exhibits that there are four indicators of creativity skill that are integrated into all lesson plans regardless of the topic discussed in them. They are, a)

involves activities conducted open-ended, problem-based learning, b) incorporate activities in which students can work collaboratively, c) manage learning environment which encourage students to solve the authentic real-worlds problem and to be inquisitive with an open mind, d) incorporate the assessments of creativity through divergent thinking, self-report and/or assessment of creative works. These following passages are to justify findings: *Peserta didik saling bertukar surat dengan peserta didik lain dalam kelompok dan saling memberikan komentar/masukan* (Lesson Plan 8, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Diberikan tabel yang berkaitan dengan kegiatan menyapa dan berpamitan dan peserta didik diminta untuk melengkapinya secara berkelompok (4 orang)* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Peserta didik melakukan 'brainstorming' untuk menuliskan hal-hal apa yang akan dituangkan dalam tulisan mereka* (developing ideas) (Lesson Plan 5, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). Write a simple description text to promote your school, a tourist object, or your hometown (Lesson Plan 4, in *Instrumen Penilaian, Kisi-kisi, dan Soal*).

Meanwhile, the second indicator of the creativity skill which is build good relationships between teachers and learner seems to be integrated in every examined lesson plan except the one which discuss about time, days, months and year. These passages support the lesson plans which incorporate the indicator: *Setelah mengikuti kegiatan pembelajaran pada pertemuan ini, peserta didik ditanya bagaimana perasaannya (REFLEKSI)* (Lesson Plan 7, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Membuat resume (CREATIVITY) dengan bimbingan guru tentang point-point penting yang muncul dalam kegiatan pembelajaran tentang materi Fungsi Sosial yang baru dilakukan* (Lesson Plan 9, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Guru memberikan penghargaan (misalnya pujian atau bentuk penghargaan lain yang relevan kepada kelompok yang kinerjanya baik)* (Lesson Plan 10, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

Similar to the second indicator, the eight indicators of the creativity skill which reads "Use defined creativity rubric with separate dimensions to novelty and usefulness" indicates to be integrated into every analyzed lesson plan besides three lesson plans which have topics of a conditional sentence, song, and text about instruction, short notice, warning, and caution. These following passages are to justify the integration of defined creativity rubric with separate dimensions to novelty and usefulness: *Peserta didik mewawancarai dua orang temannya kemudian menuliskan di dalam format yang diberikan* (Lesson Plan 2, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Menirukan dialog yang dibacakan* (Lesson Plan 3, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Siswa membuat dialog transaksional terkait sifat-sifat orang* (Lesson Plan 6, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

It also indicates that only four lesson plans which conducted activities out of school or their classroom to increase creativity. The four lesson plans have topics on greeting and leave taking, dates, days, months and year, descriptive text and song. These passages are to support the results: *Memberi tugas mencari contoh-contoh ungkapan menyapa dan berpamitan lainnya dirumah* (Lesson Plan 1, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Siswa yang memperoleh nilai diatas KKM diberi pengayaan dengan tugas membuat teks interaksi transaksional lisan dan tulis untuk memberi dan meminta informasi terkait dengan waktu tentang kegiatan yang terjadi di rumah* (Lesson Plan 3, in *Pembelajaran Pengayaan*). *Guru memberikan tugas membuat kalimat tentang jumlah dan letak suatu benda yang ada di rumah* (Lesson Plan 4, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*). *Mengagendakan atau tugas/projek/produk/ portofolio/unjuk kerja yang harus mempelajari pada pertemuan berikutnya di luar jam sekolah atau dirumah* (Lesson Plan 9, in *Kegiatan Pembelajaran*).

In parallel with the first indicator, the fifth indicator of creativity skill which contains or incorporates role-play and or other improvisation activities only applied in three lesson plans which discuss greeting and leave taking, introducing self and transactional dialogue about people, animals and things. These following passages are to indicate the findings: *Secara berpasangan peserta didik menuliskan dialog pendek berdasarkan situasi yang diberikan*

tentang menyapa dan berpamitan kemudian melakukan roleplay menggunakan dialog yang telah mereka buat (Lesson Plan 1, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Peserta didik melakukan roleplay secara berpasangan tentang perkenalan diri seperti contoh di atas (Lesson Plan 2, in Kegiatan Pembelajaran). Work in pairs and perform the dialogue. The picture (an idol) helps you make your dialogue (role play) (In Penilaian Pembelajaran, Kisi-kisi, dan Soal).

From all the explanations above, the researcher can conclude that all the indicators of creativity skills are not fully incorporated in all analyzed lesson plans. There are indicators that are incorporated in all lesson plans regardless of the topic discussed in them, but there are also indicators that are incorporated only in certain lesson plans which discuss certain topics.

Discussion

There are several attempts to integrate 4Cs into the lesson plans. (Wulandari et al., 2020) conducted research aimed to develop an innovative 21st century lesson plan focused on the 4Cs. In the first step of development procedures, it found that only a few teachers were innovatively designing lesson plans according to 21st century skills. The lesson plans used by teachers were often only copied from the previous lesson plans or from other teachers in order to fulfil administrative obligations without considering the integration of 21st century skills. In addition, the research conducted by Dwimayanti, K, Dantes, N, and Suarni (2020) shows that only a few lesson plans contain critical thinking, problem-solving, creativity, and innovation skills. In all learning objectives, there are 4Cs included. However, activities that practice students' skills in communication and collaboration have not been seen in the learning objective, and in the learning activities, collaborative skills are not provided. In terms of assessment, it only includes critical thinking and problem-solving skills.

In fact, the integration of 4Cs in the lesson plans is still facing the obstacle. The steps of learning activities in the lesson plans used by the teacher are purely the result of copying from the teacher's resource book without any kind of development and innovative student-centered learning models. All learning activities are carried out independently so that students do not train to collaborate in groups and learning activities dominantly are teaching-centered (Dwimayanti, K, Dantes, N, and Suarni, 2020). Teachers are difficulty in understanding specific effective methods of learning that assist the development of 4Cs skills, problems in developing a lesson plan for 4Cs skills, inadequate infrastructure, and students who lack confidence, effectiveness, and ability to express their opinion (Septiyanti, Siti Nur Azizah, and Fajriah, 2021). Based on the problems above, it is clear that 4Cs must be fully integrated into the classroom, school, and district across the country (NEA, n.d.). Thus, it is also necessary to develop lesson plans which integrate 4Cs skills.

As a result, all analyzed lesson plans incorporate collaboration activities that require students to work in a group. This brings different conditions revealed in a study that collaboration does not provide in the lesson plan. Moreover, for the assessment, all examined lesson plans include assessment of communication skills and some of them also incorporate the assessment of critical thinking skills and creativity skills while the previous study stated that the examined lesson plans only contained critical thinking skills (Dwimayanti, K, Dantes, N, and Suarni, 2020). In addition, this is a good start point to be continued compared with other previous research that finds the 4Cs elements contained in the lesson plan are only limited to communication and collaboration, while critical thinking and creativity have not been included (Fatimah et al., 2020).

Aside from those, the findings of this study share similar results with a previous study conducted by Radifan & Dewanti (2020) which analyzed the integration of 4Cs skills in the lesson plans of senior high school English teachers. By analyzing different samples of lesson plans, in junior high school English teachers' lesson plans, it also indicates that all lesson

plans have implemented 4Cs skills. However, there are indicators of 4Cs skills which more dominantly appear in certain topics and/or there are indicators that do not apply in any examined lesson plans. It also revealed that the 4Cs skills are mostly included in learning activity and assessment.

In addition, it can be indicated that all the 4Cs skills (communication, collaboration, critical thinking, and creativity) cannot stand alone, they are connected to one another. For instance, in communication, critical thinking, and creativity indicators, there are stated points that teachers should incorporate collaborative activity. The following passages support the findings: Involve collaborative tasks (in Communication Skill Indicator, number 1). Includes activities involving collaborative learning (in Critical Thinking Skill Indicator, number 8). Incorporate activities in which students can work collaboratively (in Creativity Skill Indicator, number 4).

Furthermore, there are two indicators that are not incorporated into all lesson plans. They are: Teach students to recognize and count for cultural differences in communicative norms (in Communication Skill Indicator, number 6). Rotate groups so that students gain experience working with different types of individuals and teams (in Collaboration Skill Indicator, number 5). Incorporates strategy for debate (in Critical Thinking Skill Indicator, number 5). This condition should be a consideration for teachers in developing lesson plans. Each indicator is important for students in improving the 4Cs skills.

Besides, the result finds that there are few critical thinking skill indicators that are only implemented in one lesson plan. This indicates that critical thinking skills are still lacking and need to be improved. The following passages are to espouse the results: Incorporates strategy for group discussion (in Critical Thinking Indicator, number 4). Incorporates strategy for reciprocal peer questioning (in Critical Thinking Indicator, number 6). Implements problem-based learning as a learning model (in Critical Thinking Indicator, number 7). Includes concept mapping task (in Critical Thinking Indicator, number 9).

Therefore, the incorporation of 4Cs skills in the lesson plans of 7th grade English Teachers has not been fully implemented based on the fulfillment of each indicator of 4Cs skills in the analyzed lesson plans. In order to achieve students' possession of 4Cs skills, teachers need to fulfill all of the indicators of each 4Cs skills in the lesson plans.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings, all of the lesson plans incorporate communication, collaborative, critical thinking, and creativity skills. There are indicators that are incorporated in all lesson plans regardless of the topics they have. However, there are also indicators that only appear in lesson plans which have a discussion on certain topics. In addition, the findings also exhibit that there are indicators that do not seem to be implemented in any lesson plans. Moreover, there are four indicators of critical thinking skills which are only incorporated in one lesson plan. It also reveals that 4Cs skills are likely to be more carried out in the learning activities and assessment than other components of lesson plans.

From all the explanations mentioned above, the researchers can infer that even though 4C skills are implemented in all lesson plans, there are still some indicators which only appear in some lesson plans or even not included in any lesson plans. This condition should be a deliberation for all educators to pay attention in the fulfilment of 4Cs skills in lesson plan so that students can learn to possess the skills.

REFERENCES

Ariyana, Y., Pudjiastuti, A., Bestary, R., & Zamromi, Z. (2018). *Buku Pegangan Pembelajaran Keterampilan Berpikir Tingkat Tinggi: Program Peningkatan*

- Kompetensi Pembelajaran Berbasis Zonasi*. Direktorat Jendral Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan.
- Dwimayanti, K., Dantes, N., & Suarni, K. (2020). Pengembangan Rencana Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran (RPP) Tema Kegiatanku Kelas I Berbasis Kecakapan Belajar dan Berinovasi Abad 21. *PENDASI: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Indonesia*, 4(1), 1–10.
- Fadel, C., Bialik, M., & Trilling, B. (2015). *Four-Dimensional Education: The Competencies Learners Need to Succeed*. Center for Curriculum Redesign.
- Fatimah, F., Tajuddin, M., Ilyas, M., & Majid, A. (2020). Analisis PPK, Literasi, 4c daan HOTS pada Silabus dan RPP Mata Pelajaran Fikih. *Quality*, 8(1), 165. <https://doi.org/10.21043/quality.v8i1.7413>
- Hall, B. M. (2013). Designing collaborative activities to promote understanding and problem-solving. *International Journal of E-Collaboration*, 10(2), 55–71. <https://doi.org/10.4018/ijec.2014040104>
- Kivunja, C. (2014). Innovative Pedagogies in Higher Education to Become Effective Teachers of 21st Century Skills: Unpacking the Learning and Innovations Skills Domain of the New Learning Paradigm. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 3(4), 37–48. <https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v3n4p37>
- Lai, E., DiCerbo, Kristen, & Foltz, P. (2017). *Skills for Today: What We Know about Teaching and Assessing Collaboration*. Pearson.
- Lai, E. R., Yarbro, J., DiCerbo, K., & Geest, E. de. (2018). *Skills for Today: What We Know about Teaching and Assessing Creativity*. Pearson.
- Luciana, N., Padmadewi, N., Artini, L., & Budiarta, L. (2020). Teachers' Readiness in Inserting the 21st Century Skills in the Lesson Plan in Teaching English. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pengajaran*, 53(2), 168-183. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.23887/jpp.v53i2.26406>
- Metusalem, R., Belenky, D. M., & DiCerbo, K. (2017). *Skills for Today: What We Know about Teaching and Assessing Communication*. London; Pearson.
- National Education Association. (2010). *Preparing 21st Century Students for a Global Society: An Educator's Guide to the "Four Cs"*. <http://www.nea.org/assets/docs/A-Guide-to-Four-Cs.pdf>
- Radifan, M. F., & Dewanti, R. (2020). The Incorporation of 4C Skills in Senior High School English Teachers' Lesson Plans. *STAIRS: English Language Education Journal*, 1(2), 42–54.
- Septiyanti, Azizah, S. N., & Fajriah, Y. N. (2021). The Challenges Encountered by EFL Teachers in Developing Students' 4C Skills in 21st-Century Education. *JEPAL: Journal of English Pedagogy and Applied Linguistics*, 1(2), 31–46.
- Snyder, L. G., & Snyder, M. J. (2008). Teaching Critical Thinking and Problem Solving Skills. *The Delta Pi Epsilon Journal*, 1(2), 90–100.
- Terasne, T., & Sugianto, N. (2019). the Effectiveness of Using Preview, Question, Read, Reflect, Recite and Review (Pq4R) Toward Students' Critical Thinking Ability on Reading Comprehension. *Jo-ELT (Journal of English Language Teaching) Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa & Seni Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris IKIP*, 6(1), 35. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jo-elt.v6i1.2348>
- Ventura, M., Lai, E. R., & DiCerbo, K. (2017). *Skills for Today: What We Know about Teaching and Assessing Critical Thinking*. Pearson.
- Wahab, A., & Terasne, T. (2020). The Effect of Inquiry-Based Learning on Students' Critical Thinking in Reading. *Jo-ELT (Journal of English Language Teaching) Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa & Seni Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris IKIP*, 7(1), 26. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jo-elt.v7i1.2690>

- Wulandari, A., Juarsa, O., & Agusdianita, N. (2020). Pengembangan RPP Inovatif Abad 21 Pada Pembelajaran Tematik di Kelas IV SD Negeri Kota Bengkulu. *JURIDIKDAS: Jurnal Riset Pendidikan Dasar*, 3(3), 362–372. Retrieved from <https://ejournal.unib.ac.id/index.php/juridikdasunib/article/view/14566>
- Yu, T. X., & Mohammad, W. M. R. W. (2019). Integration of 21st Century Learning Skills (4C Elements) in Interventions to Improve English Writing Skill Among 3K Class Students. *International Journal of Contemporary Education*, 2(2), 100. <https://doi.org/10.11114/ijce.v2i2.4498>
- Zhao, C., Pandian, A., & Mehar Singh, M. K. (2016). Instructional Strategies for Developing Critical Thinking in EFL Classrooms. *English Language Teaching*, 9(10), 14. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v9n10p14>